

COMPARISON SUMMARY OF ALTERNATIVES

--	--	--

ISSUE/ACTION	ALTERNATIVE 1	ALTERNATIVE 2
BIODIVERSITY PRESERVATION		
Re-introduce springsnails into restored Willow Spring riparian habitat	do not re-introduce	do not re-introduce
Install bat gate at Wounded Knee cave	install gate	install gate
ECOSYSTEM MANAGEMENT		
Utilize prescribed burns for resource enhancement	no prescribed burning	no prescribed burning
WILD HORSE AND BURRO MANAGEMENT	For Red Rock Herd Management Area only	
Amendment to Las Vegas RMP Red Rock HMA boundary (within NCA only)	expand to the east to include the area surrounding Calico Basin and the area around Mile 13 Campground	no change in boundary
Burro viewing areas (SR 159)	develop viewing areas along SR 159	develop viewing areas along SR 159
Safety and access	fence both sides of SR 159 and construct highway underpasses	remove nuisance animals along SR 159 as needed; additional fencing if necessary
Additional developments for water availability	initiate developments to Shovel Spring, Willow Spring, White Rock Spring, Red Spring, Pine Creek, and Wheeler Camp Spring	no new developments proposed
Existing developments	improve developments at Mud Spring #1, Lone Grapevine Spring, Tunnel Spring and Bird Spring	improve developments to Mud Spring #1, Lone Grapevine Spring, Tunnel Spring and Bird Spring
Area closure	Cottonwood Valley would be closed to organized hiking, equestrian and mountain biking events during foaling season (March - May)	Cottonwood Valley would be closed to organized hiking, equestrian and mountain biking events during foaling season (March - May)
COMMERCIAL PURPOSES	same for all alternatives - see Management Common To All Alternatives	
CULTURAL RESOURCES MANAGEMENT	same for all alternatives - see Management Common To All Alternatives	
NATIVE AMERICAN CONCERNS	same for all alternatives - see Management Common To All Alternatives	

* Many actions are the same for all alternatives and are not included in this comparison summary; see Management Common To All Alternatives in Chapter 2 for a more in depth listing.

* HMA maps for each alternative can be viewed in Chapter 2

ALTERNATIVE 3	ALTERNATIVE 4	ALTERNATIVE 5
re-introduce if surveys continue to indicate none exist on site	re-introduce if surveys continue to indicate none exist on site	re-introduce if surveys continue to indicate none exist on site
install gate	install gate	install gate
allow prescribed burning	allow prescribed burning	allow prescribed burning
delete area north of Spring Mtn Ranch on west side of SR 159 and area north of ten mile Canyon on the east side of SR 159	delete all north of SR 160	delete all within the NCA
viewing areas not proposed	SR 159 corridor not in HMA	SR 159 corridor not in HMA
remove nuisance animals along SR 159 as needed; additional fencing if necessary	SR 159 corridor not in HMA	SR 159 corridor not in HMA
no new developments proposed	new developments proposed; remove protective fencing outside of HMA if no longer needed	no new developments
improve developments at Mud Spring #1, Lone Grapevine Spring, Tunnel Spring and Bird Spring as necessary	improve developments at Tunnel Spring and Bird Spring as necessary; restore Lone Grapevine Spring and Mud Spring #1 (outside HMA)	remove protective fencing developments no longer needed; reconstruct Tunnel Spring and Bird Spring to accommodate wildlife
closure not proposed for foaling period	closure not proposed for foaling period	no foaling closure needed
same for all alternatives - see Management Common To All Alternatives		
same for all alternatives - see Management Common To All Alternatives		
same for all alternatives - see Management Common To All Alternatives		

ISSUE/ACTION	ALTERNATIVE 1	ALTERNATIVE 2
CAMPING	Proposals	
Campgrounds	use 13 Mile Campground (all other sites used in the past are closed)	use 13 Mile Campground (all other sites used in the past are closed)
Allowable camping in the "core" area (general)	same for all alternatives (see map on following page)	same
Specific consideration in core area	allow limited camping in Cottonwood Valley by permit (for events only)	no camping in Cottonwood Valley
North of La Madre Mountain	dispersed camping allowed	dispersed camping allowed
East of Bird Spring Range	dispersed camping allowed	no dispersed camping
Stay limit	14 day limit for all camping	14 day limit for all camping
Distance restrictions	no camping within 1/4 mile of springs and riparian areas; no camping within 1/2 mile of wild horse and burro water sources	no camping within 1/4 mile of springs and riparian areas
ROCK CLIMBING	same for all alternatives - see Management Common To All Alternatives	
TARGET SHOOTING	designate area at the mouth of Lucky Strike Canyon	no target shooting in the NCA
HUNTING	allowed in accordance with State regulations, except in the "cave" area which is closed	allowed in accordance with State regulations, except in the "cave" area which is closed

ALTERNATIVE 3	ALTERNATIVE 4	ALTERNATIVE 5
Proposals		
use 13 Mile Campground (all other sites used in the past are closed)	use 13 Mile Campground (all other sites used in the past are closed)	use 13 Mile Campground (all other sites used in the past are closed)
same	same	same
no camping in Cottonwood Valley	no camping in Cottonwood Valley	no camping in Cottonwood Valley
dispersed camping allowed on disturbed sites, but if monitoring shows additional impacts, sites will be designated	dispersed camping allowed on disturbed sites, but if monitoring shows additional impacts, sites will be designated	dispersed camping allowed on disturbed sites, but if monitoring shows additional impacts, sites will be designated
allowed within 200 feet of designated roads on disturbed sites	no dispersed camping	allowed within 200 feet of designated roads on disturbed sites
14 day limit for all camping	7 day limit for dispersed camping and maximum group size of 10 people; 14 day limit in campground	14 day limit for all camping
no camping within 1/4 mile of springs and riparian areas	no camping within 1/4 mile of springs and riparian areas	no camping within 1/4 mile of springs and riparian areas
same for all alternatives - see Management Common To All Alternatives		
no target shooting in the NCA	no target shooting in the NCA	no target shooting in the NCA
allowed in accordance with State regulations, except in the "cave" area which is closed	allowed in accordance with State regulations, except in the "cave" area which is closed	allowed in accordance with State regulations, except in the "cave" area which is closed

INSERT MAP# M11

ISSUE/ACTION	ALTERNATIVE 1	ALTERNATIVE 2
TRAILS (existing)	Designated Use	
Brownstone	hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian
Turtlehead	hiking only	hiking only
Calico Tanks	hiking only	hiking only
Keystone Thrust	hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian
La Madre	hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian
White Rock Loop	hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian
Grand Circle Loop	Visitor Center to White Rock road - hiking only White Rock road to Scenic Drive - add equestrian Scenic Drive to Visitor Center - add equestrian & mtn biking	Visitor Center to White Rock road - hiking only White Rock road to Scenic Drive - add equestrian Scenic Drive to Visitor Center - add equestrian & mtn biking
Moenkopi Loop	hiking only	hiking only
Childrens Discovery/Lost Creek	hiking only	hiking only
Ice Box Canyon	hiking only	hiking only
Pine Creek	hiking only	hiking only
Arnight	trailhead to Knoll Trail intersection - hiking and equestrian from intersection to Pine Creek - hiking only	trailhead to Knoll Trail intersection - hiking and equestrian from intersection to Pine Creek - hiking only
Oak Creek North	hiking, equestrian and mtn biking	hiking, equestrian and mtn biking
Oak Creek South	hiking, equestrian and mtn biking	hiking, equestrian and mtn biking
First Creek	hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian
Knoll	hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian
Dale	hiking only	hiking only
SMYC	hiking only	hiking only
Willow Spring Loop	hiking only	hiking only
Red Valley	equestrian (close to mtn biking)	equestrian & mountain biking

ALTERNATIVE 3	ALTERNATIVE 4	ALTERNATIVE 5
Designate Use		
hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian
hiking only	hiking only	hiking only
hiking only	hiking only	hiking only
hiking and equestrian	hiking only	hiking and equestrian
hiking only beyond White Rock Loop portion	hiking only	hiking only beyond White Rock Loop portion
hiking and equestrian	hiking only	hiking and equestrian
Visitor Center to White Rock road - hiking only remainder of trail back to Visitor Center - add equestrian (no mtn bikes)	all sections, other than the White Rock road, are designated as hiking only	Visitor Center to White Rock road - hiking only remainder of trail back to Visitor Center - add equestrian (no mtn bikes)
hiking only	hiking only	hiking only
hiking only	hiking only	hiking only
hiking only	hiking only	hiking only
hiking only	hiking only	hiking only
trailhead to Knoll Trail intersection - hiking only from intersection to ridge south of Pine Creek - add equestrian	hiking only	trailhead to Knoll Trail intersection - hiking only from intersection to ridge south of Pine Creek - add equestrian
hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian
hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian
hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian	hiking and equestrian
hiking only equestrian	hiking only	hiking and equestrian
hiking only	hiking only	hiking only
hiking only	hiking only	hiking only
hiking only	hiking only	hiking only
designate existing trail for mtn biking and construct a second trail for equestrian use	designate existing trail for mtn biking and construct a second trail for equestrian use	designate existing trail for mtn biking and construct a second trail for equestrian use

INSERT MAP# M12

ISSUE/ACTION	ALTERNATIVE 1	ALTERNATIVE 2
TRAILS (existing routes - not official trails)	Trail Proposals	
1. First Creek to Lost Creek (away from escarpment base)	designate as equestrian trail	designate only the section running north-south between the 2 Oak Creek Canyon accesses as equestrian trail
2. Oak Cr/Scenic Drive to Pine Creek (old road)	designate as equestrian trail	no trail designation
3. White Rock/Scenic Drive due south to intersection (old road)	designate as equestrian trail	no trail designation
4. Sandstone Quarry to Willow Spring area within Scenic Drive loop (old road)	pave and designate for hiking, equestrian and bicycle use	no trail designation
5. SR 159 due west to Oak Creek Canyon (old road)	designate for hiking and equestrian use	no trail designation
6. Loop route directly north of Red Rock Vista	designate for hiking and equestrian use	no trail designation
7. Blue Diamond to Jean route (portion within NCA)	designate for equestrian and mountain biking	no trail designation
8. Twilight Zone routes (north of Kyle Canyon Road)	designate for equestrian and mountain biking	no trail designation
9. Existing routes from Scenic Drive exit to adjacent trails	designate for connectivity between equestrian staging and adjacent trails	no trail designations
TRAILS (new construction)	Trail Construction Proposals	
10. First Creek to Oak Creek	construct for hiking and equestrian use	construct for hiking and equestrian use
11. Access to Kraft Rocks	construct for hiking only	construct for hiking only
TRAILS (other related issues)	Trail Related Proposals	
Hiking - dispersed use	no restrictions on dispersed casual use	no restrictions on dispersed casual use
Equestrian - dispersed use	allow dispersed casual use, but encourage using designated trails	allow dispersed casual use
Mountain biking - dispersed use	no dispersed use, mountain bikes are restricted to trails designated for their use, and roads	no dispersed use, mountain bikes are restricted to trails designated for their use, and roads
O Equestrian staging areas	none specifically designated	none specifically designated

* Any commercial or other permitted uses related to the above activities will have special stipulations directing how use may occur.

ALTERNATIVE 3	ALTERNATIVE 4	ALTERNATIVE 5
Trail Proposals		
designate as equestrian trail	designate as equestrian trail	designate as equestrian trail
designate as equestrian trail	no trail designation	designate as equestrian trail
no trail designation	no trail designation	no trail designation
pave and designate for hiking, equestrian and bicycle use	no trail designation	pave and designate for hiking, equestrian and bicycle use
no trail designation	no trail designation	no trail designation
designate for hiking and equestrian use	designate for hiking and equestrian use	designate for hiking and equestrian use
designate for equestrian and mountain biking	designate for equestrian and mountain biking	designate for equestrian and mountain biking
designate for equestrian and mountain biking	designate for equestrian and mountain biking	designate for equestrian and mountain biking
designate for connectivity between equestrian staging and adjacent trails	designate for connectivity between equestrian staging and adjacent trails	designate for connectivity between equestrian staging and adjacent trails
Trail Construction Proposals		
construct for hiking and equestrian use	construct for hiking and equestrian use	construct for hiking and equestrian use
construct for hiking only	construct for hiking only	construct for hiking only
Trail Related Proposals		
no restrictions on dispersed casual use	no restrictions on dispersed casual use	no restrictions on dispersed casual use
restricted to designated trails within original NCA designation (south of La Madre to the south edge of Cottonwood Valley)	restricted to designated trails within original NCA designation (south of La Madre to the south edge of Cottonwood Valley)	restricted to designated trails within original NCA designation (south of La Madre to the south edge of Cottonwood Valley)
no dispersed use, mountain bikes are restricted to trails designated for their use, and roads	no dispersed use, mountain bikes are restricted to trails designated for their use, and roads	no dispersed use, mountain bikes are restricted to trails designated for their use, and roads
Scenic Drive exit lot; Oak Creek Campground location (after campground is relocated)	Scenic Drive exit lot; Oak Creek Campground location (after campground is relocated)	Scenic Drive exit lot; lower White Rock parking lot; Oak Creek Campground location (after campground is relocated)

INSERT MAP# M13

INSERT MAP# M14

ISSUE/ACTION		ALTERNATIVE 1	ALTERNATIVE 2
DIRT ROADS		Miles (acres) to remain opened or to be closed	
North of La Madre	remain	53.2 mi	53.2 mi
	open	128.8 ac	128.8 ac
	close	16.4 mi	16.4 mi
		39.8 ac	39.8 ac
Original NCA	remain	23.9 mi	23.9 mi
	open	57.8 ac	57.8 ac
	close	49.8 mi	49.8 mi
		72.5 ac	72.5 ac
Southern Expansion	remain	15.7 mi	15.7 mi
	open	37.8 ac	37.8 ac
	close	0.0 mi	0.0 mi
		0.0 ac	0.0 ac
TOTALS	remain	92.8 mi	92.8 mi
	open	224.4 ac	224.2 ac
	close	66.2 mi	66.2 mi
		112.3 ac	112.3 ac
PAVING (existing roads, lots and overlooks)		Pave/Do Not Pave	
Red Spring	yes	yes	
White Rock (road & lot)	yes	yes	
Willow (bus turn around loop)	yes	yes	
Lost Creek (lot at trailhead)	yes	yes	
N Oak Creek (road & lot)	yes	yes	
PAVING (new construction)	Amount of Paving		
Calico III Parking/Overlook	1.2 acres	1.2 acres	
Short Loop (return road from Sandstone Quarry)	2.65 miles (5.78 acres)	do not construct	
Sandstone/Turtlehead (parking/trailhead)	.52 acre	do not construct	
Red Rock Wash (expansion)	.5 acre	.5 acre	
Rangers Choice (overlook)	.47 acre	do not construct	
Pine Creek (expansion)	.36 acre	.36 acre	

* For a more in depth breakdown of dirt roads by alternative, see appendix 20.

ALTERNATIVE 3	ALTERNATIVE 4	ALTERNATIVE 5
Miles (acres) to remain opened or to be closed		
36.4 mi 87.9 ac	31.0 mi 74.9 ac	35.5 mi 85.8 ac
33.2 mi 80.7 ac	38.6 mi 93.7 ac	34.1 mi 82.8 ac
23.9 mi 57.8 ac	23.9 mi 57.8 ac	23.9 mi 57.8 ac
49.8 mi 72.5 ac	49.8 mi 72.5 ac	49.8 mi 72.5 ac
13.5 mi 32.3 ac	11.2 mi 26.9 ac	12.8 mi 30.9 ac
2.2 mi 5.5 ac	4.5 mi 10.9 ac	2.9 mi 6.9 ac
73.8 mi 178.0 ac 85.2 mi 158.7 ac	66.1 mi 159.6 ac 92.9 mi 177.1 ac	72.2 mi 174.5 ac 86.8 mi 162.2 ac
Pave/Do Not Pave		
yes	yes	yes
yes	yes	yes
yes	yes	yes
yes	yes	yes
yes	yes	yes
Amount of Paving		
1.2 acres	1.2 acres	1.2 acres
2.65 miles (5.78 acres)	do not construct	2.65 miles (5.78 acres)
do not construct	do not construct	do not construct
.5 acre	.5 acre	.5 acre
do not construct	do not construct	do not construct
.36 acre	.36 acre	.36 acre

